

## GENERAL EDITOR'S PREFACE

The 2017 volume of the *Yearbook* opens with Andrew Killick's application of Lydia Goehr's "work-concept" (articulated in *The Imaginary Museum of Musical Works*) to Korean *kayagŭm sanjo*—a genre traditionally characterized by the flexible, highly individual reworking of musical material. During the 1960s, South Korea's Intangible Cultural Properties (ICP) protocol led to the institutionalization of the western work-concept, along with its attendant fixity. Killick examines the post-ICP output of *kayagŭm* master Hwang Byungki over a period of many years, comparing recordings and transcriptions of his *sanjo*. Hwang, while informed by his experience as a composer of new works in crafting his personal *sanjo*, continues to treat *sanjo* as something different from a "work" and thus effectively contests what Goehr calls the "conceptual imperialism" of the work-concept.

Two of the articles in this volume address methodological matters. Reflecting the material turn in the humanities, Lucy Wright examines her role as an apprentice dressmaker in the largely unstudied world of girls' carnival morris dancing in England's Northwest. The view from the sewing studio offers rich perspective: as a shared social space, it affords the ethnographer unique access to and interaction with research participants, from whom new kinds of knowledge emerge. Wright offers a close reading of the material history and design of girls' morris dress, comparing it with rather static folk revival morris costumes; she concludes that "neglect of girls' morris by scholars ... might be indicative of an unstated emphasis on visual and material appearance in some transmission models of tradition." Drawing on several theorists' invitations to recognize the transformative potential of "making," Wright advocates "material practice as a research technique" as an alternative to performance.

With her piece on Japanese women's flamenco dancing in Tokyo, Yolanda van Ede dives fearlessly into the debate between an anthropology of the senses (associated with David Howes et al.) and sensuous ethnography (associated with Tim Ingold et al.). The debate, centred on the nature of the sensing subject, has methodological implications. Indeed, van Ede argues that she could come to understand Japanese *flamencos'* embrace of the Spanish dance form only by being attuned to the sound of their stomping feet—that is, to a single sensory register. Where Ingold asserts that the human sensorium is experienced as a unison, van Ede shows how Japanese dancers learn the art of flamenco by dividing ("fragmenting") and sequencing different sensory experiences over an extended period of time. Thus she demonstrates the fruitfulness of analysing the senses individually.

As I write this preface, islands in the Caribbean Sea are being lashed by a wave of hurricanes, the strength and frequency of which are unprecedented in the region. To date, the island of Montserrat remains relatively unharmed, but

historically it has been vulnerable to environmental disaster as well as the tragedies of slavery. Kathleen Spanos's article looks at Montserratian masquerades—which bear witness to the historical co-presence of African and Irish populations—in the catastrophic aftermath of the 1995 volcanic eruption. Though their fierce rivalries and parodic vibrancy have been diminished by the destruction of villages and population displacement, the masquerades remain relevant to Montserratians' lives. In the wake of trauma, they offer catharsis and reminders of that vibrancy, archiving a complex and mutable “national” identity.

The first section of the 2017 *Yearbook* concludes with Clint Bracknell's largely historical research on the conceptualization of song among the Noongar in Western Australia. Noongar musical culture is often regarded as “lost” or, at the very least, critically endangered. Bracknell sifts through the colonial archival record, stretching back to the 1810s, in search of descriptions of Noongar musicking and musical terminology. Combined with contemporary oral evidence, the result is a valuable reclamation of Australian Aboriginal knowledge by a member of the Noongar community. The act of Noongar singing, we learn, inhabits a number of overlapping conceptual domains, including speech and dance.

Bracknell's article is a fitting segue to a special section on the relationship between song and speech, a topic of abiding interest since the era of *vergleichende Musikwissenschaft* and certainly since George List's seminal article, “The Boundaries of Speech and Song” (1963). This themed section was initially proposed to me by Estelle Amy de la Bretèque following the 2015 ICTM symposium on “Liminal Utterances” that she hosted in Nanterre, France. She then joined forces with Jeffers Engelhardt to curate a number of articles, inviting submissions, subjecting them to peer review, and revising them with authors. I, with the assistance of Rebecca Draisey-Collishaw, put them in their final form. Engelhardt's and Amy de la Bretèque's preface provides an historical backdrop to the theme and introduces the three remaining articles of the 2017 *Yearbook*.

With this volume, I announce the retirement of Barbara Alge as Website Reviews Editor. Barbara has produced superb work for the journal since 2011; her position will be ably filled by Lonán Ó Briain of the University of Nottingham. This volume is also my last as editor of the journal. It has been a privilege to serve the ICTM in this position for the last four years and a genuine pleasure to work with so many dedicated authors from throughout the world. Working closely with them has taught me more than they could possibly imagine. My gratitude extends in many more directions. I wish to thank all of the anonymous peer reviewers who wrote insightful, generous responses to the papers sent to them, and who honoured the stringent deadlines given them. The *Yearbook* works on a tight schedule, so reviewers' (and authors') willingness to work with this constraint is greatly appreciated. I would like to express my thanks to the ICTM Secretaries-General, Svanibor Pettan and (now) Ursula Hemetek, for

supporting the publication of the *Yearbook*, while allowing the General Editor her full independence. My institution, Memorial University of Newfoundland, also deserves recognition for its support.

All the review editors, present and past, have been remarkable in their ability to locate interesting and diverse material for review. They guided me gently when I started this job, and I continue to benefit from their graciousness. There are also those who assisted with the mechanics and editorial minutiae of putting a publication like this together. Carlos Yoder, Executive Assistant to the Secretariat, has been a model of efficiency and professionalism; Don Niles, former General Editor, continues to provide wise counsel at the drop of a hat. Both have been unfailingly kind. And finally, for working tirelessly with me from the beginning, I owe a great debt of gratitude to my editorial assistant, Rebecca Draissey-Collishaw, a fine ethnomusicologist and editor. I could not have done this without her.

There are two important changes related to the 2017 *Yearbook* on this, the 70<sup>th</sup> anniversary of the ICTM. One is the constitution of the *Yearbook's* inaugural editorial board; another is a fresh look. In particular, I hope you find that the new font makes reading just a bit easier.

With these thoughts, I extend a warm welcome to the *Yearbook's* new General Editor, Dr. Lee Tong Soon. Dr. Lee will be taking over in a year when the journal will be devoted to research presented at the 2017 ICTM world conference in Limerick. Please do submit your carefully revised papers to the guest editors of the 2018 volume at [ytm2018@ictmusic.org](mailto:ytm2018@ictmusic.org).

KATI SZEGO

## GUEST EDITORS' PREFACE: SPEECH, SONG, AND IN-BETWEEN

The trio of articles collected here emerged from ICTM's twenty-third colloquium, "Between Speech and Song: Liminal Utterances," held at the Centre de Recherche en Ethnomusicologie (Nanterre, France) in 2015 and organized by Estelle Amy de la Bretèque. Cutting across ethnomusicology, linguistics, sound studies, and voice studies, this curated section of the 2017 *Yearbook for Traditional Music* returns to an evergreen theme central to these disciplines: the relationship between speech and song. Indeed, as these articles reveal, the categories "speech" and "song" (and, therefore, the idea of liminal utterances) are anything but natural. They are products of specific disciplines and institutions concerned with speech, song, sound, and music.

Speaking and singing—and speech and song as categories—may or may not be separate things in different vocal cultures and listening practices. Liminal utterances are the not-quite-speech, not-quite-song of a rapper's punctuated melodic flow, a reciter's performance of sacred text, a parent's vocalizations with an infant child, or a non-human voice perceived as such. These liminal utterances might transition us between disciplines that productively employ voice in ethnographic and historical work while reifying (or disregarding) "music" as a privileged object. But, as these articles suggest in different ways, liminal utterances might not be so liminal, poised to return to the analytic certainty of speech or song. Liminality might be the outcome of etic listening, the architecture of software for linguistic and audio analysis, or alterity and social exclusion. These articles set in motion processes of writing about voice and listening that trade liminality for something inherent.

Liminality and the relation between speech and song are venerable themes in the history of ethnomusicology. In *The Rise of Music in the Ancient World, East and West* (1943), Curt Sachs locates one origin of music in the supernatural realm of song, and decidedly not in the mundane realm of speech. Writing about the "primitive singer," Sachs suggests that "he often refrains from utmost pitch and power; but when frenzy pushes him to extremes, his singing is strained: it is, and is meant to be, unlike the performer's speech voice; it is expected to be superhuman; indeed, supernatural" (ibid.:23). For Sachs, music is enchanted. Speech, on the other hand, defined negatively as the opposite of song, is outside the disciplinary and evolutionary purview of music studies.<sup>1</sup>

With these categories firmly in place, Sachs inscribes song along a continuum

---

1. It is worth noting that Sachs, despite his Berlin-school evolutionary and comparativist prejudices, was well ahead of the curve in hinting at the importance of timbre, over and above melodic contour, in accounting for voice: "The manner of singing, its timbre, force, and specific animation are often more suggestive and essential than the melodies; cultural and anthropological traits depend on the way things are done rather than on the things themselves" (1943:23).

of logogenic (“word-born”), melogenic, and pathogenic (“derived from passion and motor impulse”) vocality (ibid.:52).<sup>2</sup> The extremes of logogenesis and pathogenesis—one “a mere vehicle for words,” the other “an irresistible stimulus that releases the singer’s utmost possibilities” (ibid.:42)—verge on what could be called liminal utterances. This is especially the case if we push disciplinarily at what Sachs describes as one- or two-pitch logogenic incantations or the “orderless cataracts” (ibid.:52) of pathogenic vocality. For Sachs, of course, the comfortable, unproblematic essence of song is in the melogenic, organic, tonally organized music of “highly civilized peoples” (ibid.:43). Sachs’s evolutionary scheme shows quite clearly the ideological stakes in constructing a relationship between speech and song, and the articles here work collectively to decolonize those categories and relationships.

A genealogy of the speech/song issue in ethnomusicology can be traced through List’s work on the boundaries of speech and song (1963), Herzog’s early explorations of the relationship between music and text (1934, 1942, 1950), Blacking’s account of musical “discourse” (1982), classic works by Nettl (2005) and Seeger (1987), and recent work by Crawley (2017), Daughtry (2015), and Eidsheim (2015). Linguistically informed work addresses these themes as well, including Bloch (1974), Briggs (1993), Feld (2012), Fox (1992, 2004), Graham (1984, 1987), Harkness (2014), Nattiez (1999), Ochoa Gautier (2014), and Samuels (2004). As this body of work indicates, the question of a speech/song continuum continues to inspire discussion and debate five decades after List’s foundational article. The reason may be, as Anthony Seeger suggests, that the separation of disciplines studying different aspects of “vocal and verbal art has had a disastrous effect on the development of our thinking about them” (1986:59).

The three articles presented here intervene in overcoming this problem, building on work dealing with glossolalia and scat, for instance. Described by practitioners as an “event occurring in my throat” (de Certeau 1996:38), glossolalia is vocal production without clear semantic meaning, which multiplies the possibilities of speech. The decomposition of syllables and the combination of elementary sounds in games of alliteration create “an indefinite space outside of the jurisdiction of a language” (ibid.:42). In his study of scat, Brent Hayes Edwards (2002) also posits an extended vocal space—a continuum between instrumental uses of the voice and vocal uses of instruments. But still, very few studies build their analysis on the intimate link between the semantics and acoustics of voice production. As Feld and Fox (1994) point out, much ethnomusicological work has difficulty in simultaneously accounting for the

---

2. Sachs describes melogenic vocality as follows: “Melogenic music represents the wide middle area between the extremes of logogenic and pathogenic music. Here, cantillation of words has sufficiently increased in range to reflect the pathos of the words themselves in a flexible melodic line; and the unbridled outbursts of the pathogenic style have so much settled down that the words become distinguishable and important” (1943:42).

words and sounds of vocal production, and combined analyses of the semantics and acoustics of vocal production are few and far between.

A key concern in these articles is showing how the speech/song divide and the question of liminality coalesce around voice as embodiment, materiality, and socially significant style. In other words, ideas about speech and song, like language, can exist apart from voice, but voice does not exist apart from the social. Speaking, singing, or vocalizing in ways that may or may not be liminal is always an act of voicing oneself/themselves in a specific historical or cultural moment.

Bernd Brabec de Mori's piece brings us back to theories of origins and evolution in relation to the categories of music, speech, and song. Drawing on research with lowland South American Indigenous people, Brabec de Mori explores the continuum between fugitive and formalized/melodized/rhythmicized speech, arguing that the illocutionary potential of "musical" vocality—melodic shape, timbre, and rhythm—is what entails ontological and non-human difference. In his analysis, specific cultural practices of listening ascribe different ontologies and agencies to what is added to language through formalized/melodized/rhythmicized voice. In Brabec de Mori's words, "this difference connects with an experiential dimension of what is *added* through formalization. This dimension seems to account for the possibility of the utterance reaching otherwise unreachable entities." Here, gradations between speech and song map onto gradations between pragmatic and transcendent aspects of voice.

The collaborative article by Estelle Amy de la Bretèque, Boris Doval, Lionel Feugère, and Louis Moreau-Gaudry focuses ethnographically and acoustically on a five-minute field recording of a conversation with Armenian Yezidis. In her daughter's home, Hbo, an elder Yezidi woman from Armenia, ranges through the emic vocal/social categories of "speech" (*axavtin*), "words about" (*kilamen ser*), and "song" (*stran*) in conversation with her relatives and Amy de la Bretèque. *Kilamen ser* are sad words about pain, death, exile, and loss uttered using a conventional melodic formula, stable pitch, and free rhythm. *Stran*, on the other hand, is how Yezidis express joy and happiness, never the topics of *kilamen ser*. In their study, the authors blend ethnography with linguistic and acoustic analysis to articulate Yezidi distinctions between speech, "words about," and song. Far from arbitrary, these distinctions show the pragmatic and expressive dynamics of Yezidi voicing and uptake.

Finally, Chris Tonelli problematizes the foundations of a speech/song divide in the world of soundsinging—an abstract, experimental, non-pitch-based vocal/oral practice. For Tonelli, the "reification of 'song'" is an effect of institutional power and listeners' privileging specific kinds of vocal sound. The location of song and non-song, then, is an act of exclusion, of humanizing and dehumanizing across species and social categories (Tonelli points to the fact that soundsingers' work is sometimes described as "animal sound"). Liminality,

produced and policed disciplinarily and socially, is about bodies and belonging, kinship and violence. As Tonelli puts it, “Liminality might be best understood as a state wherein we feel a lack of access to the kinds of identity security that emerge through confident imagination of ourselves as singularly belonging to an established, concrete, and valuable social category.” Soundsinging offers us an alternative to a “between-speech-and-song” model—an alternative that places reflecting on alterity, kinship, and connection at the centre of thinking about voice.

Together, these three interventions in the speech/song debate reflect how an enduring ethnographic and analytical issue continues to push music studies, sound studies, voice studies, and linguistics along productive, intersecting pathways.

JEFFERS ENGELHARDT and  
ESTELLE AMY DE LA BRETÈQUE

## REFERENCES CITED

- Blacking, John  
1982 “The Structure of Musical Discourse: The Problem of the Song Text.”  
*Yearbook for Traditional Music* 14: 15–23.
- Bloch, Maurice  
1974 “Symbols, Song, Dance, and Features of Articulation: Is Religion an Extreme Form of Traditional Authority?” *European Journal of Sociology/Archives Européennes de Sociologie/Europäisches Archiv Für Soziologie* 15/1: 55–81.
- Briggs, Charles  
1993 “Personal Sentiments and Polyphonic Voices in Warao Women’s Ritual Wailing: Music and Poetics in a Critical and Collective Discourse.” *American Anthropologist* 95/4: 929–57.
- Crawley, Ashon T.  
2017 *Blackpentecostal Breath: The Aesthetics of Possibility*. New York: Fordham University Press.
- Daughtry, J. Martin  
2015 *Listening to War: Sound, Music, Trauma, and Survival in Wartime Iraq*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- de Certeau, Michel  
1996 “Vocal Utopias: Glossolalias.” *Representations* 56: 29–47.
- Edwards, Brent Hayes  
2002 “Louis Armstrong and the Syntax of Scat.” *Critical Inquiry* 28/3: 618–49.
- Eidsheim, Nina Sun  
2015 *Sensing Sound: Singing and Listening as Vibrational Practice*. Durham, NC: Duke University Press.
- Feld, Steven  
2012 *Sound and Sentiment: Birds, Weeping, Poetics, and Song in Kaluli Expression*. 3rd ed. Durham, NC: Duke University Press.
- Feld, Steven, and Aaron Fox  
1994 “Music and Language.” *Annual Review of Anthropology* 23: 25–53.

Fox, Aaron

- 1992 "The Jukebox of History: Narratives of Loss and Desire in the Discourse of Country Music." *Popular Music* 11/1: 53–72.  
 2004 *Real Country: Music and Language in Working-Class Culture*. Durham, NC: Duke University Press.

Graham, Laura

- 1984 "Semanticity and Melody: Parameters of Contrast in Shavante Vocal Expression." *Latin American Music Review* 5/2: 161–85.  
 1987 "Three Modes of Shavante Vocal Expression: Wailing, Collective Singing, and Political Oratory." In *Native South American Discourse*, ed. Joel Sherzer and Greg Urban, 83–118. New York: Mouton de Gruyter.

Harkness, Nicholas

- 2014 *Songs of Seoul: An Ethnography of Voice and Voicing in Christian South Korea*. Berkeley: University of California Press.

Herzog, George

- 1934 "Speech-Melody and Primitive Music." *The Musical Quarterly* 20/4: 452–66.  
 1942 "The Text and Melody in Primitive Music." *Bulletin of the American Musicological Society* 6: 10–11.  
 1950 "Song." In *Funk and Wagnalls Standard Dictionary of Folklore, Mythology, and Legend*, ed. Maria Leach, 1032–50. New York: Funk and Wagnalls.

List, George

- 1963 "The Boundaries of Speech and Song." *Ethnomusicology* 7/1: 1–16.

Nattiez, Jean-Jacques

- 1999 *Proust musicien*. Paris: Christian Bourgeois éditeur.

Nettl, Bruno

- 2005 *The Study of Ethnomusicology: Thirty-One Issues and Concepts*. Rev. ed. Urbana: University of Illinois Press.

Ochoa Gautier, Ana María

- 2014 *Aurality: Listening and Knowledge in Nineteenth-Century Colombia*. Durham, NC: Duke University Press.

Seeger, Anthony

- 1987 *Why Suyá Sing: A Musical Anthropology of an Amazonian People*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.  
 1986 "Oratory Is Spoken, Myth Is Told, and Song Is Sung, but They Are All Music to My Ears." In *Native South American Discourse*, ed. Joel Sherzer and Greg Urban, 59–82. New York: Mouton de Gruyter.

Sachs, Curt

- 1943 *The Rise of Music in the Ancient World, East and West*. New York: W.W. Norton.

Samuels, David W.

- 2004 *Putting a Song on Top of It: Expression and Identity on the San Carlos Apache Reservation*. Tucson: University of Arizona Press.



